CITIZENSHIP AND LIFELONG LEARNING MONITOR 2019

ITALY
ABSTRACT

The following report represents one of eight national case studies feeding into the SOLIDAR Foundation’s annual Citizenship and Lifelong Learning Monitor 2019. The purpose of the Monitor is to take stock of the developments at European and national level in terms of citizenship education policies and lifelong learning policies. The Italian report is focused on the general three main themes: digital citizenship, citizenship education and intercultural dialogue. It accounts for challenges, governmental approaches to them, and civil society approaches to them for each of the three themes. Italy has developed comprehensive reforms on digital and citizenship education, but their implementation has been disappointing with political instability, and subsequent reviews of the reforms watering down the changes. The population is seriously unprepared in terms of digital skills attainment, while regional inequalities in terms of digital infrastructure among the North and South are very pronounced. The ageing teaching workforce and the teacher shortages are frustrating the implementation of these reforms but also the education that learners receive. The upcoming citizenship education reform will make the topic stand-alone, but it remains to be seen how it will be implemented and whether the training that teachers receive for the implementation of this topic will be updated. A further pressure on the educational system is the high ELET rate, the underachieving migrant background pupils compared to the native ones, and the regional inequalities in terms of academic achievement. SOLIDAR Foundation members report disappointment at being excluded from consulting on citizenship education reforms, and given the breadth of projects that they run, they make a strong case for the need for better synergies among all stakeholders in the provision of lifelong learning for citizens’ inclusion in society.

INTRODUCTION

Italy’s current toxic debate regarding migration stands in for a situation in which civic competences and intercultural dialogue are relegated to lesser positions. Inequalities of resources and of access to education between the North and South reveal a fractured society and a state where many do not receive the needed support to successfully integrate in society. The tumultuous period, with numerous government changes and the economic crisis’ aftermath, led to an ineffective coordination of reform implementation for digital education and for digital infrastructure investment, contributing to Italy being one of the European countries faring the worst in terms of digital skills acquisition. SOLIDAR Foundation members offer informal and non-formal learning opportunities to compensate for deficiencies in formal education but highlight their exclusion from reforming education or from providing holistic education.

---

On policy level, there seems to be an awareness in Italy related to digital citizenship, based on its National Digital Strategy and the National Plan for Digital Education – a pillar of the 2015 La Buona Scuola reform. However, the term reflects more the efforts of improving digital interaction among citizens and the government. Italy is scoring poorly, below the EU average, in terms of eGovernment implementation, since limited resources, inconsistent planning and insufficient coordination frustrate the successful implementation of reforms such as the digital population registry, the online payment system, the rationalisation of public administrations’ databases, among others. The situation is complicated by the fact that only 44% of the Italian population had at least basic digital skills in 2016, a number below the EU average. Moreover, inequalities among the Northern and Southern parts of Italy are observed, with access to digital resources more limited in the rural South. The expected coverage with fast broadband of 100 mbps or more by 2020 in the Southern part is only 36%. This is 20 pps lower than in the rest of Italy, though it must be noted that the situation beyond the South is still dispiriting – only 23.9% of the households had ultrafast broadband in 2018, significantly lower than the EU 60% average. Investment in digital infrastructure remains a priority, revealing how Italy lags behind other European countries.

Though results of digital education strategies were modest, and the digital infrastructure is outdated, the Italian government’s strategies are innovative, going beyond hard skills and revealing a multi-faceted conceptualization of digital citizenship which is not the case in other EU countries that fare better with digitalization. La Buona Scuola’s digital pillar identifies that introducing more technology in schools is insufficient, and considers digital education as a cultural initiative. Open, collaborative, and participatory ways of teaching are championed, using digital education to boost pupils’ personal development for a better integration in schools and society. The creation of digital identities, digital content and the development of digital competences are objectives for pupils’ personal development identified in this

---

4 Ibid. P.42.
5 Ibid. P.50.
For this, investment in digital infrastructure is the first main action, as broadband connection is missing in many schools. This is followed by envisioned training for teachers to create a welcoming environment for promoting digital skills and for allowing Bring Your Own Device policies. The goal is ensuring schools' digital administration, while pupils are connected to a digital profile to facilitate interaction among parents, teachers, and pupils. A framework of digital competence for pupils was developed based on the World Economic Forum's 21st century skills. Teacher Digital competences are included in Initial Teacher Training (ITE), while pedagogical use of technology is part of the induction and probationary period for new teachers. Prospective primary and secondary education teachers are evaluated during their ITE based on teacher-specific digital competences, and secondary education ones have to pass a competitive examination upon completing ITE, which tests teacher-specific digital competences as well. The attention paid to building teachers' capacities continued in the National Plan for Teacher Training (2016-2019) which prioritized digital education. National Digital School Plans reinforced the Plan for Teacher Training by preparing 8000 teachers to become digital animators providing peer-support to the whole-school community.

Source: World Economic Forum

---

9 Ministry of Education, University and Research of Italy. Piano Nazionale Scuola Digitale.
11 Ibid. P72.
CASE STUDY

SOLIDAR Foundation member, ARCI is the most important Italian social promotion organization. Operating since 1957, it boasts 1,000,000 members, 115 local committees, 17 regional committees, and 4,800 clubs that defend the rights of the most vulnerable in society (migrants, asylum seekers, refugees, Roma people, among others). It coordinated a two-year long EU-funded project entitled RE-ACT: Respect and Equality: Acting and Communicating Together (2017-2019) with the objective of protecting the most vulnerable in the online realm. Joined by partners from Spain, Germany, France and UK, they have researched instances of online hate speech in project partner countries, studying vast amounts of social media activity, and, then, based on the collation of the results, developed counter-narratives to effectively combat the variety of instances of hate speech existent online.

The counter-narratives were used to develop an educational toolkit with activities for pupils aged 13 to 18, preparing teachers to smoothly insert these activities in the school curriculum. The objective was to educate youngsters to become online activists, taking up the social responsibility of promoting positive counter-narratives to the poisonous hate speech currently spreading virtually. The CSOs took on the responsibility of teaching pupils to be responsible citizens online as well as offline, ensuring that values related to appropriate behavior online are spread and peaceful coexistence is promoted.

6

It is to be expected that many are not eager to increase their workload in terms of implementing digital competences within the curriculum in such a situation. Moreover, without an ability to recruit and retain new teachers into profession, the pace at which teachers will adapt to technological developments will be slowed down, impacting pupils’ chances to integrate in society. CSOs complemented gaps experienced by learners as much as infrastructural deficiencies across the country allowed them to.

15 Ibid. Pp.4-5.
CASE STUDY

One of ARCI’s local clubs, in Genova, has been working in partnership with a CSO called Zanshin Tech Social Promotion Association to train citizens to become digital warriors. The Zanshin Tech strategy emulates martial arts on the topic of cybersecurity, preparing children to thwart enticements, cyberbullying and online threats in general, while training adults to counteract online scams, cyberstalking, cybermobbing. Classes last 1.5 hours while learners are provided with all necessary digital resources. The training procedure is participatory, with advanced pupils peer-supporting newcomers. The project raises awareness on dangers associated with digitalization, and specifically with insufficiently trained people that access the vast online world. It develops vigilant internet users that can protect themselves and others, performing their social responsibility to their full abilities.
Beyond large scale projects, SOLIDAR Foundation member, ARCI, relies on the work of the dedicated members of its 4800 local clubs. Each club develops activities aligned with ARCI values. In this respect, local radio stations were set up, with citizens trained by ARCI local clubs on running their own shows. The themes discussed on these programmes range from environmental protection to local culture to mental health. Beyond the topical relevance of this project, citizens are trained on digital tools, receiving a voice that they can spread further through media channels.

The Italian situation points towards structural deficiencies influencing digital skills acquisition and inequalities among regions. Policy documentation supporting a thorough process of digitalization and of preparing citizens for joining a digital society is in place, but implementation lacks. CSOs compensate many of these gaps, managing to aid many citizens because large organisations, such as ARCI, have taken up on this task. However, this is not a sustainable model, as CSOs should collaborate with a government that acknowledges the urgency of preparing citizens to integrate in the digital society.

**CASE STUDY**

SOLIDAR Foundation member, ARCI, specialized in identifying the risks of rapid digitalization on disadvantaged communities. The REACT educational toolkit is complemented by a toolkit developed in 2016, within the framework of the EU-funded project *PRISM: Preventing, Redressing, and Inhibiting Hate Speech in New Media (2014-2016)*. Joined by partners from UK, Spain, France, ARCI designed workshops for youngsters aged 14 to 25 to raise awareness on hate speech, to explain the possible ways in which hate speech is perpetuated online and to build up socially responsible citizens that can police the virtual world to combat hate speech and socialize others into recognizing inappropriate and damaging behavior. The resources provided by ARCI debunked myths while creating 10-hour long training exercises that could be easily implemented in formal, informal and non-formal contexts.
SOLIDAR Foundation members report that the subject is approached as a cross-curricular theme, being taught using a civics education model, as information about the Italian history, geography, constitution and governance is transmitted. SOLIDAR Foundation members inform about the fact that the European dimension is insufficiently approached in formal education, as it is restricted to History classes, and the breadth of information covered depends on the availability of each teacher. Considering the aforementioned situation related to the ageing teaching profession, and to teachers feeling insufficiently valued, it seems to be problematic to expect an increased workload in terms of including the European dimension within citizenship education. However, in general, the quality of instruction in schools, and implicitly in relation to citizenship education, is hindered by teacher shortages, as 1 in 3 school heads report this issue. Furthermore, Italy is one of the countries with the most acute shortage of teachers prepared to teach in a multicultural setting and of teachers prepared to teach pupils coming from socio-economically disadvantaged backgrounds, as reported by school principals.\(^\text{16}\)

La Buona Scuola, which emphasized citizenship education, and specifically skills, attitudes and values\(^\text{17}\) has not been implemented appropriately, and went through a number of governmental reviews\(^\text{18}\), leading to a lack of coordination and planning in ensuring its success. Moreover, though citizenship education was a general objective of education, its implementation was left to the devices of each school\(^\text{19}\), raising concerns about inequalities in the provision of the subject and about the workload that teachers experience without sufficient support. However, starting from the school year 2020/2021, civic education will be taught as a separate subject, benefiting from 33 hours allotted per year\(^\text{20}\). This requires a new approach to teacher training, as, currently, there is no ITE component including citizenship education\(^\text{21}\), Continuous Professional Development (CPD) is being provided on a compulsory basis\(^\text{22}\), including on the topic of citizenship, though it remains to be seen how this will be approached given how teachers must dedicate more time to citizenship education. Until the reform comes in place, schools have had, since 2017, the chance to apply, under the National Operational Programme for the school sector 2014-20, for funding to run various citizenship education projects. Schools were eligible to receive 30000 euros for 30-60 hour modules on global citizenship, approaching themes such as environmental education, economic citizenship and Civic education.


\(^\text{19}\) Ibid. P.5.


ucation, respect of diversity and active citizenship\textsuperscript{23}. However, only approximately 15.68 million euros was dedicated towards classes on civic values, diversity and active citizenship, with only approximately 81.39 million euros being accessed by schools\textsuperscript{24} out of the total sum of 120 that was ear-marked for the National Operational Programme\textsuperscript{25}. The support is therefore not nearly enough, with schools also not being incentivized to access these funds or not having sufficient staff members prepared to engage the topic in the class.

\textbf{SOLIDAR Foundation members report dissatisfaction about the fact that CSOs, especially those involved in promoting civic values, are not invited to participate in the process of educational reform, even if via an advisory role.} Moreover, they mention how regional best practices are not systematized or reviewed, leading to a lack of oversight on how to plan citizenship education nationally. Moreover, using local practices for the provision of civic values education would need CSOs engagement, as their work in the field yielded many strategies that can be upscaled through cooperation with public authorities and stakeholders. As the new reforms in education will begin implementation, SOLIDAR Foundation members hope that more effective measures for evaluation of competencies for this subject, highlighting learning in the non-formal context as well, will be put in place. Our members suggest the usage of skills portfolio to evaluate learning while accounting for students’ extra-curricular efforts.

The delayed reforming of citizenship education, the disengaged teacher work force and the lack of adequate teacher training, point towards an inadequate way of planning the subject reform. The constant reviews of the La Buona Scuola reform delayed action on citizenship education, while public authorities denied reliance on CSOs advice and work. The renewed interest in citizenship education must be followed-through while partnerships among education stakeholders must be set to provide learners with a comprehensive strategy for acquiring civic competences needed to integrate in society.

Italy has been backsliding in terms of its early leaving from education and training (ELET) rate as of recently. The rate has been steadily decreasing since 2009 from 19.1% to 14.5% in 2018, but it is important to note that it increased from the 2017 14% rate. This is a worrisome trend, especially since Italy is above the EU average of 10.6% revealing a high number of learners left behind in terms of societal inclusion. Even more worrisome is the fact that though 12% of native pupils dropped out of education and training, 35% of the ones with migrant backgrounds did so in 2018.

Moreover, non-Italians are more at risk of grade repetition compared to native pupils (31.3% vs. 10%) Social cohesion is difficult to be achieved as groups of people are left behind in this manner. The participation in adult education was at 8.1% in 2018, increasing since the 6% of 2009, but still below the EU average of 11.1%. This data crudely reveals an insufficient attention paid to the needs of all learners, failing to create an inclusive education that would aid all in managing the daily life in the current society. The inequalities grow larger based on regions, as the 19% ELET rate in the South and the islands of Italy is above the 11% ELET rate of the Northern part of Italy. The basic skills attainment also reveals inequalities and a division between North and South. The different investment in educational infrastructure and the different attention paid to the staff members working in each region, as Italy confronts with an exodus of teachers from the South searching for employment in the North, impacted the returns on education in each region. The whole-school approach championed by La Buona Scuola fails those most in need of additional support, migrant background pupils. The aforementioned ELET rates for migrant background pupils are even more striking given that since 2013 there are 12.5 pps more migrant pupils in the Italian education system. As the members of the disadvantaged group grows, the problem deepens, plunging Italy deeper into societal polarization. The results are shocking given that Italy enjoys a robust legal architecture for including migrants and refugees in education. Intercultural education is an overarching objective of school curriculum, a feat not achieved in many European countries, though it is not enough considering how this is treated as a cross-curricular theme with clear indications on how to be implemented in countries like France and Germany.

Another instance where Italy appears to be progressing, but could do more, is the fact

---

27 Ibid.
31 Ibid. P.7.
that psychosocial support is made available to unaccompanied migrants but not to other migrant background students. To compensate for this, CPD in Italy is aimed at raising teachers’ awareness on the academic and socio-emotional needs of migrant background pupils. It encourages religious pluralism, respect for all and empowerment in every teacher, aiding them to develop relations with pupils but also with their families. However, the responsibility again falls on the shoulders of over-burdened teachers, running the risk of being deficiently met. Specialised staff should be assigned in each school for these holistic needs. This is something which the official documents encourage, as teachers and schools are supposed to collaborate with local organisations to implement a whole-school approach while also engaging in extra-curricular activities to develop pupils socio-emotionally as well. However, based on teachers’ expanding workload and on SOLIDAR Foundation members’ experiences such cooperation is not happening sufficiently in practice.

Newcomers are integrated relatively quickly in mainstream education as they join these classes after spending between 16 and 24 weeks special classes. The focus in these classes is Italian language, indeed stunting the development of pupils at the same pace with their native peers, but still doing so less than in countries where participation in special classes can last for longer. Migrant pupils have their integration sped up by extra-curricular activities, which range from language development to creative or sport or intercultural activities. The objective is boosting pupils’ intercultural competences. The Italian system relies on a buddy-system in school, with second genera-

---

38 European Commission. Integrating Students from Migrant Backgrounds into Schools in Europe. P.27.
39 Ibid. P.85.
40 Ibid. P.87.
41 Ibid. P.106.
42 Ibid. P.142.
tion migrant pupils supporting newcomers as they join mainstream education\textsuperscript{43}. To ensure that pupils are wholly supported, practical training courses are organized for their parents, to boost their Italian language skills and to familiarize them with the school system and with how they could contribute, by staying involved in their children’s education\textsuperscript{44}.

To combat stereotypes, promote peaceful coexistence, but also bridge the national dimension with the European one, CSOs have been launching various campaigns, prompting citizens to take an active role in a learning process boosting intercultural dialogue. This is particularly relevant in Italy as the toxic debate around the migrant crisis\textsuperscript{45} diluted the understanding of intercultural dialogue and has been creating us-vs-them divisions that contribute to dismantling social cohesion.

The whole-school approach and inclusive education are championed by official documents but the performance of disadvantaged backgrounds students are unsatisfactory. The implementation of initiatives is deficient, while civil society is not appropriately involved in providing holistic education.

\textbf{CASE STUDY}

SOLIDAR Foundation member, ARCI, implemented, in partnership with organizations from Spain, France and Romania, a campaign entitled IntoEurope. It ran from January 2018 until June 2019, building momentum for the European Parliament (EP) elections. The aim was combatting stereotypes and prejudices related to migrants and refugees, as the migration debate was raising at the top of the agendas in many EU countries and during the EP election. To combat populist rhetoric and teach people about the shared European history and about the EU’s role, the project partners established eight groups composed of 25 diverse citizens who worked together on understanding the role of EU policies for the integration of migrants and for combatting hate speech and on building a positive counter-narrative for the future of Europe. They have contributed to producing vibrant campaign material, used to inform people in the run-up to the EP election, while empowering citizens to become activists. The multiplier event opened the doors to other citizens, sharing knowledge on spreading out support for intercultural dialogue and peaceful co-existence via active participation in society.

\textsuperscript{43} European Commission. Integrating Students from Migrant Backgrounds into Schools in Europe. P151.
\textsuperscript{44} Ibid. P158.
FUNDING

The public expenditure on education dropped significantly in Italy, as in 2018 3.8% of the GDP was dedicated to education. This number is below the EU average of 4.6%, and given the issues related to inadequate investment in digital infrastructure, to low teacher wages and to unequal regional results in education, there is a clear need to increase investment in education. Furthermore, technological developments will occur at an increased pace in the future while the number of migrant background pupils, the ones currently underperforming in education, will increase. SOLIDAR Foundation members report that CSOs still depend on short-term funding linked with specific projects, revealing a straitjacket in terms of planning and a lack of flexibility as their funded actions are linked with specific deliverables. They also report a decrease in the state funding for CSOs in the year 2019 from 180 billion euros to 57 billion euros. The 57 billion euros is now divided among two funds instead of a unique one for the third sector as before.

This reveals an underfunded education system and a problematic funding system for CSOs at a time when many pupils are educationally underperforming, when the inequality gap among regions is increasing and when poor investment, planning and coordination leads to initiatives being inadequately implemented. The lack of resources is a problem frequently highlighted as a root cause of the situation regarding people’s flexibility in adapting to a digital society or people’s levels of civic competences, which points towards a need to address this issue.

---

RECOMMENDATIONS

DIGITAL CITIZENSHIP
- More investment in the development of the digital infrastructure;
- Review of ITE and CPD for teachers, ensuring that the contents adequately prepare teachers to use digital tools;

CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION
- Inclusion of CSOs in the development of education reforms given their experience in informal and non-formal education;
- Better planning, coordination and monitoring of the education reforms to ensure that the encouraging contents of policy initiatives become a reality;
- Reform the formal education evaluation system for citizenship education to use skills portfolios in order to facilitate the recognition of civic competences acquired in informal and non-formal settings;
- Review of ITE and CPD for teachers, providing the opportunity to specialize in civic education;

INTERCULTURAL DIALOGUE
- Better collaboration among public authorities and CSOs in organizing and delivering whole-school education;
- Inclusion of specialized staff and other stakeholders in the provision of whole school education;
- Review of ITE and CPD for teachers to empower them to work in a multicultural environment;

FUNDING
- Increased public funding in education and for CSOs;
- Targeted investment to ensure closing inequality gaps between the North and South of Italy;

GENERAL
- Improve the recognition of the teaching profession to boost teacher recruitment and retention.


